YEARBOOK

YEARBOOK

2015-16
Evaluative Criteria Booklet

Virginia High School League
1642 State Farm Blvd.
Charlottesville, VA 22911
434-977-8475 / 434-977-5943 (fax)
www.vhsl.org

School: _____

Name of Yearbook: _____

Rating: ☐ Superior / ☐ Excellent / ☐ Good / ☐ Needs Improvement

STATEMENT OF PURPOSE

The purpose of the Virginia High School League's Publications Evaluation Service is to facilitate improvements in Virginia high school publications. The evaluator's comments and suggestions should be used primarily as guidelines to increase the effectiveness of your scholastic publication.

Your evaluation is a critique from another qualified person's perspective. That perspective includes many variables: education, experience, trends and even subjective preference. When submitting a publication for critique, there is an expectation of acceptance of results, whether or not you agree with or choose to implement them.

VHSL awards are presented annually at the VHSL Regional Media Championship. Publications are evaluated by out-of-state evaluators who are experts in scholastic publications: Ava Butzu, Alexis Campion, Kathy Craghead, Melissa Dixon, Allison Floyd, Donna Griffith, Nancy Hastings, Ken Henderson, Carole Henning, Deborah Mayer, Amy Morgan, Wayna Polk, Jane Robbins, Brian Thies, Anne Whitt, Lori Wilken.

VHSL recommends that you submit your publication to other evaluation services in addition to the League's for additional comments and suggestions.

PUBLICATIONS EVALUATION SERVICES ENTRY POLICY

Yearbooks submitted for entry in the VHSL Publications Evaluation Services are considered officially entered only if the following conditions are met:

1. The VHSL Publications Evaluation registration form has been completed.
2. One copy of the yearbook produced that school year has been submitted.
3. The correct entry fee accompanies your entry.
4. Your entry is RECEIVED by the June 15 deadline. Summer and fall delivery yearbooks may be submitted until Sept. 30 if the June 15 deadline for registration and fees has been sent.

For additional information contact VHSL at 434-977-8475 or by e-mail at lgiles@vhsl.org.

STUDENT PUBLICATION: Work on a student publication should be one of the most challenging academic experiences a high school provides. Students not only learn to write for a real audience from original research, they receive training in editing, layout and design, photography, computer skills and business management. Beyond that, personal growth is achieved in responsibility, dependability, leadership, teamwork and ethical decision making. The product should be student produced, under the training and supervision of the adviser and other professionals. Since the purpose of the VHSL's program is to encourage schools to produce quality student publications, work done by individuals other than students at your high school must be clearly identified.

SPECIAL NOTE: No publication will be rated, nor will it receive an award if it uses obscene graphics or language (whether obvious, coded or disguised). No publication containing plagiarized or libelous material will be rated, nor will it receive an award. Publications should indicate that permission was given for use of copyrighted material (for example: used with permission by Associated Press).

REVISED: December 2015 by VHSL Scholastic Publications Advisory Committee members Heidi Craft (Atlee HS), Taren Meekins (Glen Allen HS), Shelly Norden (Kettle Run HS), Beth Skaggs (Osbourn Park HS) and Susan Sullivan (Oakton HS). Lisa Giles, VHSL assistant director, facilitated the process.

GENERAL STIPULATIONS

On the following pages the evaluator will mark "Superior," "Excellent," "Good" or "N/I" (Needs Improvement) for each specific point as it pertains to your publication.

The categories are as follows:

> 1. Concept
> 2. Coverage
> 3. Design
> 4. Writing
> 5. Photography

The evaluation in each category will be separate. Yearbooks will also be rated in each category as to the overall quality of work relating to that evaluation criteria:

<p align="center">Superior / Excellent / Good / Needs Improvement</p>

The rubric shall be used as a guide, not a score card. Evaluation is not based on a point system. The check marks denoting Superior, Excellent, Good and Needs Improvement are ratings, not rankings. Ratings are defined as relative standings. Therefore, the final cumulative ranking given to the publication will be based upon, but not necessarily equal to, the number of Superiors, Excellents, Goods and Needs Improvements given to the publication.

RESULTS

Good sportsmanship is expected of all VHSL activities participants and includes conduct becoming to a participant and graceful acceptance of results.

If you have legitimate concerns with the results of your evaluation (e.g. your evaluation is incomplete), the League may review your evaluation. Please provide the League with a detailed letter stating your concerns and a copy of your Evaluative Criteria Booklet via e-mail, mail or fax within 14 days of the posted results.

Please note that disagreeing with the judge's findings is not justification for review and remember that the primary purpose of an evaluation is to provide information to a staff that will help it to improve its publication. Awards are secondary.

EVALUATOR: QUESTIONS AND SCORING

Please mark SUPERIOR, EXCELLENT, GOOD or N/I (NEEDS IMPROVEMENT) for each SPECIFIC POINT as it pertains to the publication. Include under the COMMENTS FROM THE EVALUATOR section any ideas or suggestions you have for improvement as well as praise for those things well done. When you have completed the entire section, please circle a rating based on your overall assessment of the quality of that section.

We do expect that final ranking--Trophy Class, First Class, Second Class and Third Class--will match up with a majority of Superior, Excellent, Good or Needs Improvement ratings. If it does not, please provide specific justification to help advisers and staffs to understand your conclusions.

IMPORTANT NOTE: Coverage criteria are listed according to traditional yearbook sections; however, traditional sections are not required. All of these areas must be covered within the book, regardless of organizational structure.

Unless otherwise noted, "photograph" should be interpreted as unposed action shot.

I. THEME/CONCEPT

A. Cover/Endsheets	Superior	Excellent	Good	Needs Improvement
1. The name of the book and year appear on the front cover. The name of the book, name of school, city, state, year and volume number appear on spine.	☐	☐	☐	☐
2. The theme/concept is introduced on the cover and spine and developed on the endsheets, title page, opening, dividers and closing.	☐	☐	☐	☐
3. Cover design reflects the quality of professional standards. Colors used create a favorable impression. Type is attractive, readable.	☐	☐	☐	☐
4. Endsheets are plain or theme/concept-related. Table of Contents may appear on the front endsheet.	☐	☐	☐	☐

RATING: ☐ Superior / ☐ Excellent / ☐ Good / ☐ Needs Improvement

B. Theme/Concept	Superior	Excellent	Good	Needs Improvement
1. Theme/concept is contemporary and relevant to the students, the school and the year.	☐	☐	☐	☐
2. Theme/concept is developed visually on the endsheets and/or opening spread(s) with well-written, specific copy that gives evidence to validate theme/concept.	☐	☐	☐	☐
3. Opening headlines, photographs and captions develop the theme/concept.	☐	☐	☐	☐
4. Opening does not include staff listing, message from the principal or dedication.	☐	☐	☐	☐
5. The book is logically organized in accordance with its selected theme/concept.	☐	☐	☐	☐
6. Dividers introduce sections and develop the theme/concept in well-written, specific copy.	☐	☐	☐	☐
7. Divider headlines, photographs and captions develop the theme/concept for the section that follows.	☐	☐	☐	☐
8. Closing coverage concludes the theme/concept development in well-written, specific copy.	☐	☐	☐	☐

RATING: ☐ Superior / ☐ Excellent / ☐ Good / ☐ Needs Improvement

C. Reader Aids

	Superior	Excellent	Good	Needs Improvement
1. Title page contains theme/concept, name of book, year, volume number, name of school, complete street address, web address, telephone number and school population.	☐	☐	☐	☐
2. Table of Contents listing appears on the endsheet or opening (not the title page) and accurately lists the first page of each section, the index and the closing.	☐	☐	☐	☐
3. Folios specifically list the page's content.	☐	☐	☐	☐
4. Index is a continuous listing of proper nouns that appear in the book: all people, groups, clubs, organizations, teams, places, businesses and story topics. If ads are used, advertisers should be listed in the index.	☐	☐	☐	☐
6. Index is easily readable.	☐	☐	☐	☐
7. Acknowledgments (if included) and colophon with pertinent Information appear before the closing or on the rear endsheet.	☐	☐	☐	☐

RATING: ☐ Superior / ☐ Excellent / ☐ Good / ☐ Needs Improvement

COMMENTS FROM THE EVALUATOR:

    STRENGTHS:

    ————

    SUGGESTIONS FOR IMPROVEMENT:

    ————

SECTION RATING: ☐ Superior / ☐ Excellent / ☐ Good / ☐ Needs Improvement

II. COVERAGE

NOTE: The following criteria are listed according to traditional yearbook sections; however, traditional sections are not required. All of these areas must be covered within the book, regardless of organizational structure.

A. Student Life	Superior	Excellent	Good	Needs Improvement
1. The staff covers the entire year. Spring delivery books may cover spring activities in a supplement or in the next year's book.	☐	☐	☐	☐
2. Copy, headlines, photographs and captions cover daily events as well as special events.	☐	☐	☐	☐
3. Coverage reflects the unusual interests and activities of students so individual school differences are obvious.	☐	☐	☐	☐
4. Local, regional, state and national events are covered from the student/school perspective.	☐	☐	☐	☐
5. Community coverage shows student involvement as workers, buyers and volunteers in their community.	☐	☐	☐	☐

RATING: ☐ Superior / ☐ Excellent / ☐ Good / ☐ Needs Improvement

B. Academics	Superior	Excellent	Good	Needs Improvement
1. Coverage features the scope of the complete curriculum and the various programs in year-specific stories.	☐	☐	☐	☐
2. Copy, headlines, photographs and captions cover the wide range of learning activities, focusing on students, NOT THE FACULTY.	☐	☐	☐	☐

RATING: ☐ Superior / ☐ Excellent / ☐ Good / ☐ Needs Improvement

C. People	Superior	Excellent	Good	Needs Improvement
1. Every spread includes student life coverage with related headlines, copy, photographs, and captions in addition to portraits. Faculty coverage features more than just academic situations.	☐	☐	☐	☐
2. Senior achievements may appear on the spread with the portraits or in a separate reference section.	☐	☐	☐	☐
3. Names appear in alphabetical order with first name, then last name.	☐	☐	☐	☐
4. Faculty portrait spreads list full names, titles, exact subject taught, and sponsorship of activities (coaching or advising), which may appear in a separate reference section.	☐	☐	☐	☐
5. Coverage is balanced among grade levels.	☐	☐	☐	☐

RATING: ☐ Superior / ☐ Excellent / ☐ Good / ☐ Needs Improvement

D. Sports	Superior	Excellent	Good	Needs Improvement
1. Coverage includes all school teams and topics such as game action, practices, sideline activities, the coaches and fans. Intramural and individual sports may be covered.	☐	☐	☐	☐
2. Girls sports and JV/minor sports have been covered fairly.	☐	☐	☐	☐
3. A scoreboard provides the numerical result of each competition and the team's overall W/L/T record. Scoreboards may appear on the same spread as the coverage or in a separate reference section.	☐	☐	☐	☐

RATING: ☐ Superior / ☐ Excellent / ☐ Good / ☐ Needs Improvement

E. Clubs/Organizations	Superior	Excellent	Good	Needs Improvement
1. Coverage of clubs/organizations includes related headlines, photographs of the groups' activities, captions and body copy.	☐	☐	☐	☐
2. Coverage features the events and activities of the school's clubs and organizations throughout the year but does not focus on goals, objectives or mission statements.	☐	☐	☐	☐

RATING: ☐ Superior / ☐ Excellent / ☐ Good / ☐ Needs Improvement

COMMENTS FROM THE EVALUATOR:

    STRENGTHS:

    _____

    SUGGESTIONS FOR IMPROVEMENT:

    _____

SECTION RATING: ☐ Superior / ☐ Excellent / ☐ Good / ☐ Needs Improvement

III. DESIGN

A. Spread Design	Superior	Excellent	Good	Needs Improvement
1. Design enhances overall appearance by utilizing a column or grid plan in placement of body copy, photographs and captions.	☐	☐	☐	☐
2. Each spread has a clear center of visual interest and a hierarchy of coverage is evident.	☐	☐	☐	☐
3. Pictures contrast in size and shape, but the design avoids oddly shaped pictures that detract from the spread or distort the photograph.	☐	☐	☐	☐
4. External and internal margins are consistent.	☐	☐	☐	☐
5. Negative space/white space is planned, avoiding placement that calls attention to itself.	☐	☐	☐	☐
6. Action of photographs faces into the gutter and avoids splitting faces.	☐	☐	☐	☐
7. Graphics used on the spread unify, separate or emphasize individual elements and neither overpower nor detract from spread content.	☐	☐	☐	☐
8. Portrait panels form a solid rectangle with names to the outside.	☐	☐	☐	☐
9. Headsizes and backgrounds are reasonable, uniform and consistent.	☐	☐	☐	☐
10. Group photographs do not dominate the spread.	☐	☐	☐	☐
11. Business, personal and/or senior ads show consistency in design presentation avoiding ornate or distracting graphics.	☐	☐	☐	☐
12. Credit is given to photographers, writers and page designers but should be the smallest point size on the spread.	☐	☐	☐	☐

RATING: ☐ Superior / ☐ Excellent / ☐ Good / ☐ Needs Improvement

B. Typography	Superior	Excellent	Good	Needs Improvement
1. Headlines and reader entry points effectively lead the reader into the copy.	☐	☐	☐	☐
2. Headline type in each section is consistent within family, size and design and is related to theme/concept.	☐	☐	☐	☐
3. The staff uses both primary and secondary headlines: primary heads to attract and interest the reader and secondary heads to give specific information based on the content of the story.	☐	☐	☐	☐
4. Copy is readable and proportionate to headline and caption size.	☐	☐	☐	☐
5. Each photograph has a caption or an identification line that is logically placed. Group captions are acceptable, provided photos and captions are clearly identified.	☐	☐	☐	☐
6. Captions are set with consistent font size and leading and begin with effective type devices.	☐	☐	☐	☐
7. Any reverses and overprints are readable.	☐	☐	☐	☐
8. Scoreboards use consistent design elements: type, point size, alignment and leading.	☐	☐	☐	☐
9. All group photographs are identified by the name of the sport/club in distinctive type. All rows are designated front and back using contrasting type.	☐	☐	☐	☐

RATING: ☐ Superior / ☐ Excellent / ☐ Good / ☐ Needs Improvement

COMMENTS FROM THE EVALUATOR:

STRENGTHS:

─────

SUGGESTIONS FOR IMPROVEMENT:

─────

SECTION RATING: ☐ Superior / ☐ Excellent / ☐ Good / ☐ Needs Improvement

-8-

IV. WRITING

A. Body Copy – General Guidelines	Superior	Excellent	Good	Needs Improvement
1. Staff avoids the use of school's name, its initials, mascot's name, "this year," or a specific year.	☐	☐	☐	☐
2. Each copy block begins with a lead that hooks the reader. Leads vary so that patterns have not been established.	☐	☐	☐	☐
3. Writers avoid editorializing and give sources for all opinions expressed.	☐	☐	☐	☐
4. Sentences are brief and paragraphs short. No copy appears as a single short or long paragraph.	☐	☐	☐	☐
5. Transitions provide continuity so that the reader moves smoothly from paragraph to paragraph.	☐	☐	☐	☐
6. Quotes from students tell something specific about the year and are free of generalities and statements that would be true of any school or any year.	☐	☐	☐	☐
7. Staff uses proper attribution for all quotations.	☐	☐	☐	☐
8. Staff avoids use of indefinite terms such as "many," "some," "a lot," "numerous," "several," "various," "few," and "a variety."	☐	☐	☐	☐
9. Staff avoids cliches.	☐	☐	☐	☐
10. Staff avoids the use of passive voice.	☐	☐	☐	☐
11. Titles, quotes, numbers, etc. follow a consistent style (i.e. AP style guidelines).	☐	☐	☐	☐
12. All copy consistently follows acceptable rules of grammar, mechanics and usage.	☐	☐	☐	☐

RATING: ☐ Superior / ☐ Excellent / ☐ Good / ☐ Needs Improvement

B. Body Copy – Content Specific Criteria	Superior	Excellent	Good	Needs Improvement
1. With coverage that is included every year, copy uses unique angles and specific details that capture the story, making it different from the year before.	☐	☐	☐	☐
2. Academics copy stresses student involvement in the learning process, not the content of the curriculum.	☐	☐	☐	☐
3. Academics and club/organizations copy stresses events of the year and avoids purposes, goals, aims.	☐	☐	☐	☐
4. Club/organization copy is more than a list of officers and sponsors or a reiteration of aims, purposes or goals.	☐	☐	☐	☐
5. Sports copy shows consistent use of the apostrophe.	☐	☐	☐	☐
6. Sports copy is more than a summary of the scoreboard, featuring unique angles.	☐	☐	☐	☐
7. Sports copy omits apologies, editorial comments, alibis, congratulations and predictions about the next season.	☐	☐	☐	☐

RATING: ☐ Superior / ☐ Excellent / ☐ Good / ☐ Needs Improvement

C. Captions – General Guidelines

	Superior	Excellent	Good	Needs Improvement
1. Captions begin with impact leads that vary in grammatical pattern.	☐	☐	☐	☐
2. Based on reporting, captions answer all reader questions (who, what, when, where, why and how), using more than one sentence when needed.	☐	☐	☐	☐
3. Captions must identify all individuals in the photograph. When six or more are pictured, a group identification is acceptable.	☐	☐	☐	☐
4. Captions consistently follow acceptable rules of grammar, mechanics and usage.	☐	☐	☐	☐
5. The action of the photograph is explained in present tense; the remainder of the caption is in past tense.	☐	☐	☐	☐
6. Captions do not make derogatory or slanderous remarks about individuals, groups or the school.	☐	☐	☐	☐
7. Sports captions vary in presentation to avoid a pattern, include the results of the action depicted and report the score and winner of the game/meet/match.	☐	☐	☐	☐
8. In sports captions, players should be identified by name, number and position, including opponents when possible.	☐	☐	☐	☐

RATING: ☐ Superior / ☐ Excellent / ☐ Good / ☐ Needs Improvement

D. Headlines – General Guidelines

	Superior	Excellent	Good	Needs Improvement
1. Headlines tell something specific and avoid generalities which could be used any year. Label headlines are not used.	☐	☐	☐	☐
2. Headlines employ descriptive nouns and active verbs that fully and accurately describe the nature of the spreads they highlight.	☐	☐	☐	☐

RATING: ☐ Superior / ☐ Excellent / ☐ Good / ☐ Needs Improvement

COMMENTS FROM THE EVALUATOR:

STRENGTHS:

SUGGESTIONS FOR IMPROVEMENT:

SECTION RATING: ☐ Superior / ☐ Excellent / ☐ Good / ☐ Needs Improvement

V. PHOTOGRAPHY

A. General Guidelines	Superior	Excellent	Good	Needs Improvement
1. Photographs other than portraits and group photos are substantially the work of students.	☐	☐	☐	☐
2. Photographs have excellent contrast and/or color tones.	☐	☐	☐	☐
3. The staff uses photographs that are clear, sharp, and high resolution.	☐	☐	☐	☐
4. The staff has cropped photos effectively with an understanding of composition.	☐	☐	☐	☐
5. Staff chooses pictures which use different techniques that add impact to the photography (e.g. - high angle, low angle, side lighting, back lighting, leading lines, repeated shapes, framing, etc.).	☐	☐	☐	☐
6. Staff avoids all mugging and posed shots, not to be confused with storytelling portraiture.	☐	☐	☐	☐
7. Photographs feature a variety of students representative of the diversity of the school's population.	☐	☐	☐	☐

RATING: ☐ Superior / ☐ Excellent / ☐ Good / ☐ Needs Improvement

B. Content Specific Guidelines	Superior	Excellent	Good	Needs Improvement
1. Photographs show students at school, in daily routines, at special events and in the community.	☐	☐	☐	☐
2. Staff credits all photos purchased from outside sources (i.e., wire services).	☐	☐	☐	☐
3. Photographs avoid shots of the entire classroom, many shots of only one person, similar activities and obviously posed shots.	☐	☐	☐	☐
4. Photographs feature a wide range of learning action: labs, tests, research, field trips, special assignments, etc.	☐	☐	☐	☐
5. Individual portraits avoid profiles, "environmentals," props (roses, hands folded, books) and tilts.	☐	☐	☐	☐
6. Sports photography includes sideline shots, practices and different games (matches, meets) and features different types of action.	☐	☐	☐	☐
7. Club/organization candids show members involved in events and activities, not just seated at meetings.	☐	☐	☐	☐
8. Group photographs are arranged to focus on faces for the purpose of identification. No props are used. Large groups have been divided into more than one photograph.	☐	☐	☐	☐
9. Groups are cropped to the waist of those on the front row and just above the heads of those on the back row and to the left and right of those on the sides.	☐	☐	☐	☐

RATING: ☐ Superior / ☐ Excellent / ☐ Good / ☐ Needs Improvement

COMMENTS FROM THE EVALUATOR:

    STRENGTHS:

      _____

    SUGGESTIONS FOR IMPROVEMENT:

      _____

SECTION RATING: ☐ Superior / ☐ Excellent / ☐ Good / ☐ Needs Improvement

EVALUATOR'S SUMMARY

TOTAL SCORING

		Rating			
		S	**E**	**G**	**NI**
I.	Theme/Concept	☐	☐	☐	☐
II.	Coverage	☐	☐	☐	☐
III.	Design	☐	☐	☐	☐
IV.	Writing	☐	☐	☐	☐
V.	Photography	☐	☐	☐	☐

Trophy Class, First Class, Second Class and Third Class should match up with a majority of Superior, Excellent, Good or Needs Improvement ratings. If it does not, judge must provide a specific justification to help advisers and staffs to understand the decision.

EVALUATOR'S OVERALL RATING: ☐ Superior / ☐ Excellent / ☐ Good / ☐ Needs Improvement

EVALUATOR'S OVERALL RANKING: ☐ Trophy Class / ☐ First Class / ☐ Second Class / ☐ Third Class

EVALUATOR'S GENERAL COMMENTS: